Upgrading apprenticeships: a cross-country experience from Egypt, Tunisia and Jordan

South South Expo
ILO Solutions Exchange Forum
19 Feb 2014

Christine Hofmann
Skills Development Specialist
ILO Decent Work Team for North Africa
Agenda

I) Defining apprenticeship systems
5 major elements of apprenticeship
Why do we talk of informal apprenticeship systems?
Formal – informal – traditional apprenticeship

II) Understanding informal apprenticeship systems
Why do they work?
Why they sometimes do not work
Issues and policy options for upgrading

III) Country examples: Egypt, Tunisia and Jordan
Country situation
Project experience and lessons learnt

IV) ILO tools and publications
I Defining informal apprenticeship

5 major elements of apprenticeship

Why do we talk of informal apprenticeship systems?

Formal – informal – traditional apprenticeship
Five major elements of informal apprenticeship according to ILO R60 and R117

• Training system and not just a way of learning
• Training contract between learner (apprentice) and trainer (master craftsperson)
• The core of training takes place in an enterprise
• Training for a trade/ recognized occupation
• Systematic and long-term (initial training)

Do not confuse apprenticeship with

**Enterprise attachment**  
(the trainee is mainly trained in a centre)

or

**Internship**  
(only partial skills)

or

**Family helper**  
(main purpose is contribution to business)
Why do we talk of informal apprenticeship systems?

A training contract

- training & allowances
- labour service

Master Trainer  Apprentice

Embedded in rules and regulations
Formal, informal or traditional apprenticeship systems?

- **Institutional Framework**

- **Traditional**
  - Rules based on customs, social norms or traditions
  - Enforced by...
    - The family

- **Informal**
  - Rules based on customs, social norms or traditions
  - Enforced by...
    - Social networks
    - Informal associations
    - Clans

- **Formal**
  - Rules based on legal acts or formal regulations
  - Enforced by...
    - Governments
    - Trade unions
    - Employers organizations
II Understanding informal apprenticeship systems

Why do they work?

Why they sometimes do not work

Issues and policy options for upgrading
Why do they work?

Traditional way skills are transferred to the next generation (Pre-industrial Europe, informal economies in Africa and Asia)

• They make economic sense to employers:
  • Employer recovers training investment when apprentice has become productive but still works at lower wage level than skilled workers
  • Best candidates can be retained
  • **Apprentices learn while they earn** and have incentives to stay until the end – higher wage after completion

• **Skills are relevant**: training is embedded in work processes, and employers train, who know what skills are needed on the labour market.
Why they sometimes do not work

- **Drop outs**
  - Apprentices leave the enterprise before completing apprenticeship for a better wage somewhere else (lack of incentive to complete)
  - thus master craftspersons have little incentive to invest in training and offer more apprenticeship places

- **Exploitative practices**
  - Master craftspersons keep certain skills to themselves to prevent apprentices from leaving – and thus make apprentices stay for very long periods without imparting skills
  - Child labour
Issues for upgrading informal apprenticeship

Quality of training
Enhance access to new skills and technology for mentors
Provide new skills for apprentices
Monitor and assure training quality and content

Financing
Ensure that incentives are in place that businesses and apprentices participate

Decent work and equality
Abolish child labour in informal apprenticeship
Improve working conditions and health and safety at work
Improve social protection
Strengthen gender equality

Linkages between IA and formal systems
Promote contracts
Promote recognition of skills in formal labour markets
Support formalization of unregistered businesses
III Country examples – Egypt, Tunisia and Jordan

Situation in the country
Project experience
Lessons learnt
Apprenticeship in Egypt

- Study in Greater Cairo in 2009: car mechanics, textile and ready-made clothes, metal works, wood work
  - 75% of master craftspeople acquired skills through informal apprenticeship
  - High informality: affiliation to professional associations/unions 13%, 20% non-registered
  - 25% of apprentices were below 15 years
  - High drop-out rate (57%)
  - Apprenticeship period varies from 6 months to more than 4 years

- Legislative review in 2013: currently 6 apprenticeship systems operating in parallel, one responding to informal apprenticeship reality (under MoMM)

  ILO support to strengthen its implementation
**Project experience in Egypt**

1) ILO/WFP/UNICEF child labour project (2008-11)
Apprenticeship component reached 1000 apprentices in 72 occupations including: glassware, soap production, barber, baker, turner, wood painter, plumber, tailor

- **Project achievements:** Formalization of working relation through apprenticeship contract (tadarrug elmeheni), regular monitoring, OSH improvements

2) ILO/WFP/UNICEF child labour project (2011-14)
Apprenticeship component targets 3000 apprentices in 25 agriculture-related trades

- **Project achievements:** Apprenticeship contract, skills scorecard for each occupation, off-the job training to apprentices (one day per week during 4 months), master craftspersons trained, OSH improvements
The institutional set-up

Apprenticeship board at governorate level
Chair: Governor/ General Undersecretary

Representative of apprentices
MoSS
MoMM
Reputable organization
Investors’ association
Donor
Secretariat = Apprenticeship officer in MoMM

Training provider

Implementing partner (NGO)

Quality group
Conducts spot checks on logbooks

Community

Participating businesses and apprentices
Supports
Facilitates and implements scheme
Mobilizes
Guides
Reports to

Mobilizes Support
Facilitates and implements scheme
Lessons learnt from Egypt

- No or very weak small business associations
- NGOs and other community organizations successfully mobilize businesses
- Low capacity of MoMM to fulfil supporting role
- Duration of apprenticeship too long for many occupations
- Gap in legislation: No employment contract available for below 18 year-olds who completed apprenticeship
- ILO WISE (Work improvement in small enterprises) methodology proved very useful
- Interest by Food Chamber in partnering for final assessment
- Sustainability?
Apprenticeship in Tunisia

Study on formal and informal apprenticeship under joint programme on Youth – Employment – Migration (UNDP, UNIDO, FAO, IOM, ILO) – sample of 124 enterprises

Three types of apprenticeship (besides alternance and residential training):

- Formal apprenticeship leading to recognized certificate
- Non-formal apprenticeship for youth not meeting entry requirements (23% of all trainees in vocational training in 2011, contract F-0, meaning they do not attend complementary training in training centres)
- Informal apprenticeship
Project experience in Tunisia

- Workshop in May 2013 to discuss study findings
- Numerous good practices in Tunisia were identified, but experience was not shared, and training of apprenticeship counselors had been neglected in the past
- Recommendations included:
  - Improving governance and reviewing the regulatory frame
  - Strengthening the role of the apprenticeship counselor and the workplace trainers (maitre d’apprentissage)
  - Open pathways from apprenticeship to further learning
- Decision to create a virtual platform under Spanish funded Youth Employment project to
  - share good practices, tools and material
  - Enable practitioners to exchange and discuss
  - Strengthen the socio-professional network among apprenticeship counselors and workplace trainers
Lessons learnt from Tunisia

- Good collaboration between Ministry, training authorities, workers and employers organizations around joint objective
- Prototype will go live end of February
- Designed flexibly to allow for additions
- Screenshot:
Apprenticeship in Jordan

- Study to understand informal apprenticeship in auto-repair and printing sector (employment potential)
- No legal framework to support apprenticeship
- Considerable mismatch between skills supply and demand
- 55% of labour force in private sector is informal

Apprenticeship identified as effective training system

Pilot designed with International Youth Foundation (IYF)
Project experience in Jordan

- Youth received 6 months training in private training centre (organized through IYF, including OSH, life skills, IT, rights at work, career guidance) and 4 months on-the-job training in micro and small enterprises
- Apprentices received accident insurance and participated in competition for best apprentice
- Training quality was improved through on-the-job skills tracking, training of workplace trainers, award to best employer, regular monitoring visits
- OSH improvements at workplace through WISE (Work Improvement in Small Enterprises)
- Banner indicated *Training workshop*
- Apprentices participated in skills assessment for work license: 85% passed
Lessons learnt from Jordan

- Duration of on-the-job training needs to increase
- Challenging to agree to standard apprenticeship contract, working hours and working conditions
- Training for employers is easier if conducted at the employers’ workshop – unwilling to leave workshop
- Pilot model to be improved, adapted, and expanded at national level
- Employers need to be in driving seat, hence closer involvement of employer associations and other stakeholders is paramount!
ILO tools and publications

Policy brief
Workshop reports (2007, 13)

Research publications
- Forthcoming: Comparison of systems across countries
- in Tanzania, Malawi, Egypt, North Sudan, Tunisia, Bangladesh
  - in Ivory Coast and DRC (effect of reintegration of ex child soldiers on informal apprenticeship – jointly with IPEC)
  - in Ghana: Financial arrangements, youth livelihoods

Resource guide
  – Forthcoming: Guide on skills assessments of small industry organisations

Technical cooperation projects in:
Zimbabwe, Bangladesh, Benin, Burkina Faso, Tanzania, Egypt, Tunisia
Thank you for your attention!

Christine Hofmann
hofmann@ilo.org